



# BIMETRIC THEORY OF FRACTIONAL QUANTUM HALL STATES

**Andrey Gromov** 

Kadanoff Center for Theoretical Physics University of Chicago

Quy Nhon, July 16, 2018

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS



Dam Thanh Son (UChicago)



Zlatko Papic (Leeds)



Dung Nguyen (Oxford)



Zhao Liu (Berlin)



Barry Bradlyn (Princeton)



Scott Geraedts (Google)

AG, Scott Geraedts, Barry Bradlyn Phys. Rev. Lett. 119, 146602 AG, Dam Thanh Son Phys. Rev. X 7, 041032 Dung Nguyen, **AG**, Dam Thanh Son Phys. Rev. B 97, 195103 Zhao Liu, **AG**, Zlatko Papic ArXiv:1803.00030

# PLAN

#### Introduction

- Fractional quantum Hall effect
- ``Non-relativistic'' Geometry
- Chern-Simons theory

#### Girvin-MacDonald-Platzman mode

- Lowest Landau Level
- $W_{\infty}$  algebra
- Single Mode Approximation

Bimetric theory of FQH states

- Bimetric theory
- How does it work ?
- Consistency checks
- Geometric quench

Conclusions and open directions

#### QUANTUM HALL BAR



Gold-coated graphene quantum Hall bar, Physical Measurement Laboratory (2014)

 $R_H = \frac{V}{I}$ 

# FRACTIONAL QUANTUM HALL EFFECT



 $H = \sum U(|x_i - x_j|)$ i, j

- Fractional Hall conductance
- Fractionally charged quasiparticles
- Fractional statistics
- Topological degeneracy

\* . . .

Laughlin 1983 Arovas, Schrieffer, Wilczek; Halperin 1984 Haldane, Rezayi 1985

# AT THE PLATEAU

- Gap to all excitations (charged and neutral)
- All dissipative transport coefficients vanish
- Parity and time-reversal broken
- No Lorentz invariance
- Quantized non-dissipative transport coefficients
- Not uniquely characterized by the filling factor

$$N = \nu N_{\phi} \qquad \qquad \sigma_{xy} = \nu \frac{e^2}{h}$$



Fractional quantum Hall problem is often treated in the topological limit

$$\hbar\omega_c \to \infty \qquad \qquad \Delta_{\rm Coulomb} \to \infty$$

In this limit Hamiltonian is 0 and dynamics occurs only at the edge

I would like to understand the FQH away from the topological limit

#### TOPOLOGICAL LIMIT

# GEOMETRY

Geometry is encoded into time-dependent metric



$$ds^2 = g_{ij}(\mathbf{x}, t) dx^i dx^j$$

It is more convenient to use vielbeins

$$g_{ij} = e_i^A e_j^B \delta_{AB} \qquad \qquad \mathbf{g} = \mathbf{e} \cdot \mathbf{e}^T$$

There is a SO(2) redundancy

Corresponding ``gauge field" is the *spin* connection  $\,\omega_{\mu}$ 

Spin connection is a ``vector potential" for curvature

$$\frac{R}{2} = \partial_1 \omega_2 - \partial_2 \omega_1 \qquad \qquad \omega_0 \sim \epsilon_A{}^B e_B^i \partial_0 e_i^A$$

CHERN - SIMONS THEORY OF FQH STATES



Wen-Zee term *couples the TQFT to the geometry* of ambient space

Breaks Lorentz down to SO(2) since  $\omega_{\mu} = \omega_{\mu}^{AB} \epsilon_{AB}$ 

Wen, Zee 1991

## WEN - ZEE TERM

Wen-Zee term couples the electron density to curvature

$$\rho = \frac{\nu}{2\pi}B + \frac{\nu s}{4\pi}R$$

Implies a global relation on a compact Riemann surface



Quantum number S = 2s is called *Shift* 

Also describes the quantum Hall viscosity

$$\langle T_{xx}T_{xy}\rangle = i\omega\eta_H$$
  $\eta_H = \hbar\frac{\mathcal{S}}{4}\bar{\rho}$ 

Haldane 1983 Wen, Zee 1991 Avron Zograf Seiler 1995 Read 2009

#### ``GRAVITATIONAL''AHARONOV - BOHM EFFECT



# $\Psi \longrightarrow e^{2\pi i \mathbf{S} \Phi_R} \Psi$

Wen Zee 1992



# BEYOND TQFT (THEORETICAL) TOOLS

Beyond TQFT we face a strongly interacting problem

- Trial states
- Flux attachment (composite bosons and fermions)
- Exact diagonalization
- Bimetric theory

#### SPECTRUM OF FQH PROBLEM



At  $E \sim gap$  there is a collective mode

### OBSERVATION OF THE GMP MODE



Kang, Pinczuk, Dennis, Pfeiffer, West 2001

Kukushkin, Smet, Scarola, Umansky, von Klitzing 2009

GIRVIN - MACDONALD - PLATZMAN MODE

The electron density operator  $z_j = x_j + iy_j$  is the electron coordinate



Projected densities **do not commute**, instead they form a  $W_{\infty}$  algebra

$$\left[\bar{\rho}(\mathbf{k}), \bar{\rho}(\mathbf{q})\right] = 2i \sin\left[\frac{\ell^2}{2}\mathbf{k} \times \mathbf{q}\right] \bar{\rho}(\mathbf{k} + \mathbf{q})$$

This algebra is believed to be at the heart of the Lowest Landau level problem

GMP have argued that the collective mode is a projected density wave

$$|\mathbf{k}
angle = \bar{
ho}(\mathbf{k})|0
angle$$

GIRVIN - MACDONALD - PLATZMAN MODE II

At long wavelengths the GMP state takes form

$$|\mathbf{k}\rangle \approx \left[k^2 T^+ + \bar{k}^2 T^- + \dots\right]|0\rangle$$

The spin-2 operators  $T^{\pm}$  form an  $sl(2,\mathbb{R})$  algebra



In the LLL  $T^{\pm}$  are differential operators

$$T^+ \propto \sum_i z_i$$
  $T^- \propto \sum_i \frac{\partial}{\partial z_i}$ 





We will construct a long wavelength effective theory of GMP mode

#### GENERAL REMARKS ABOUT THE GMP MODE

★ Universally present in **fractional** QH states

★ Absent in **integer** QH states

★ Angular momentum or ``spin" 2, regardless of

microscopic details

 $\star$  Effective theory of the GMP mode should to be a

theory of a massive spin-2 excitation

#### BIMETRIC THEORY

## SPIN-2 DEGREE OF FREEDOM

A spin-2 mode is described by a symmetric 2x2 matrix  $\hat{g}_{ij}$  with  $\det \hat{g}_{ij} = 1$ 

Can be visualized as a solution of equation  $\hat{g}_{ij}x^ix^j = 1$ 



Together with the ambient metric



 $\hat{\mathbf{g}}_{ij}$ 

# BIMETRIC GEOMETRY

The spin-2 mode is described by a symmetric tensor  $\hat{g}_{ij}(\mathbf{x},t)$ 

Subject to a constraint  $\det \hat{g}_{ij} = \det g_{ij}$ 

Introduce the ``vielbein''  $\hat{g}_{ij} = \delta_{\alpha\beta} \hat{e}^{\alpha}_i \hat{e}^{\beta}_j$ 

 $\widehat{SO}(2)$  spin connection and curvature follow

$$\frac{\hat{R}}{2} = \partial_1 \hat{\omega}_2 - \partial_2 \hat{\omega}_1 \qquad \qquad \hat{\omega}_0 = \frac{1}{2} \epsilon^{\alpha}{}_{\beta} \hat{e}^i_{\alpha} \partial_0 \hat{e}^{\beta}_i$$

Not the same as two copies of Riemannian geometry

$$\operatorname{Diff} \times \widehat{\operatorname{Diff}} \to \operatorname{Diff}_{\operatorname{diag}}$$

This geometry involves **two** metrics  $\hat{g}_{ij}, g_{ij}$ , hence *bimetric*\*

\*Re-appeared recently in theories of massive gravity de Rham, Gabadadze, Tolley 2010

# BIMETRIC THEORY

Chern-Simons theory interacting with fluctuating metric  $\hat{g}_{ij}(\mathbf{x},t)$   $\mathcal{L} = \frac{k}{4\pi}ada - \frac{1}{2\pi}Ada - \frac{s}{2\pi}ad\omega - \frac{\varsigma}{2\pi}ad\hat{\omega} - \mathcal{H}[\hat{g};g]$ Integrate out the internal gauge field a $\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_1[A,g] + \mathcal{L}_{bm}[\hat{g};A,g]$ 

Where  $\mathcal{L}_1[A,g]$  contains no dynamics and is discarded

For IQH k = 1 there is no *intra-LL dynamics* 

$$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_1[A;g]$$

AG, Son 2017

#### BIMETRIC THEORY

Effective theory of the spin-2 mode at long wavelengths



- quantized phenomenological parameter
- m the energy scale of the spin-2 mode
- $\gamma$  phenomenological parameter responsible for the nematic transition



## GEOMETRIC OPERATORS

Density and current operators acquire geometric meaning

Fluctuations of electron density = fluctuations of local Ricci curvature

$$\rho = \frac{\nu\varsigma}{4\pi}\hat{R}$$

Fluctuations of electron current = fluctuations of ``gravi-electric'' field

$$j^i = \frac{\nu\varsigma}{2\pi} \epsilon^{ik} \hat{\mathcal{E}}_k$$

To the leading order in  ${f k}$  , *everything* is determined by  $~~ \varsigma$ 

Continuity equation holds identically

$$\partial_0 \hat{R} + \epsilon^{ik} \partial_i \hat{\mathcal{E}}_k \equiv 0$$



 $\hat{g}_{ij} = \delta_{ij}$ 

 $\hat{g}_{ij} = \hat{g}_{ij}^{(0)}(\gamma) \neq \delta_{ij}$ 

#### LINEARIZATION

In flat space we chose the parametrization

and linearize around isotropic configuration

$$\hat{\mathbf{g}}_{ij} = \delta_{ij} \qquad \qquad Q = 0$$

Gap of the GMP mode  $\mathcal{L}_{\rm bm} \approx i \frac{\varsigma \bar{\rho}}{4} \bar{Q} \dot{Q} - \frac{m(1-\gamma)}{2} |Q|^2$ 

Maciejko, Hsu, Kivelson, Park, Sondhi 2013

to find

You, Cho, Fradkin 2014

# ELECTRON DENSITY AND CURRENT

Fluctuations of electron density are governed by fluctuations of local Ricci curvature

$$\delta \rho = \frac{\nu\varsigma}{4\pi} \hat{R}$$

Projected static structure factor computation reproduces a classic result

$$\bar{s}(k) = 2\pi\nu^{-1} \langle \delta\rho_{-k}\delta\rho_k \rangle = \frac{2|\varsigma|}{8} |k|^4 + \dots$$

This is to be compared with the general result

$$\bar{s}(k) = \frac{|\mathcal{S} - 1|}{8} |k|^4 + \dots$$

Leading to identification

$$2|\varsigma| = |\mathcal{S} - 1| \quad \underline{\text{Vanishes for IQH}}$$

AG, Son 2017

#### CANONICAL QUANTIZATION

Turn off electric field

$$\frac{\nu\varsigma}{2\pi}Ad\hat{\omega} = \frac{\nu\varsigma}{2\pi}\bar{B}\hat{\omega}_0 = \varsigma\bar{\rho}\epsilon_{\alpha}{}^{\beta}\hat{e}^i_{\beta}\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\hat{e}^{\alpha}_i$$

From the action we read the commutation relations

$$\left[\hat{e}^{i}_{\alpha}(\mathbf{x}), \hat{e}^{\beta}_{j}(\mathbf{x}')\right] = -\frac{2i}{\varsigma\bar{\rho}}\delta^{i}_{j}\epsilon_{\alpha}{}^{\beta}\delta(\mathbf{x}-\mathbf{x}')$$

Appeared in Verlinde 1989

Haldane 2011

### GMP ALGEBRA

Components of intrinsic metric do not commute with each other

$$\begin{aligned} \left[ \hat{g}_{zz}(\mathbf{x}), \hat{g}_{\bar{z}\bar{z}}(\mathbf{x}') \right] &= 2\hat{g}_{z\bar{z}}(\mathbf{x})\delta(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}') \\ \left[ \hat{g}_{zz}(\mathbf{x}), \hat{g}_{z\bar{z}}(\mathbf{x}') \right] &= \hat{g}_{zz}(\mathbf{x})\delta(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}') \\ \left[ \hat{g}_{\bar{z}\bar{z}}(\mathbf{x}), \hat{g}_{z\bar{z}}(\mathbf{x}') \right] &= -\hat{g}_{\bar{z}\bar{z}}(\mathbf{x})\delta(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}') \end{aligned}$$

These relations define  $\mathfrak{sl}(2,\mathbb{R})$  Lie algebra

The density operators form the  $\,w_\infty$  algebra = small  $\,{f k}\,$  limit of the GMP

$$[\delta\rho(\mathbf{k}), \delta\rho(\mathbf{q})] = i\ell^2(\mathbf{k}\times\mathbf{q})\delta\rho(\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q})$$

**Bimetric theory reproduces essential FQH features beyond topological order** 

AG, Son 2017



Gravitational Chern-Simons term breaks  $\mathfrak{sl}(2,\mathbb{R})$  but respects  $w_{\infty}$  for density

This term turns on when the metric  $\hat{\mathrm{g}}_{ij}$  is inhomogeneous



### SUMMARY

- $\star$  *Projected* static structure factor up to  $|\mathbf{k}|^6$
- $\star$  Dispersion relation of the spin-2 mode up to  $|{f k}|^2$
- ★ Absence of the spin-2 mode
- ★ Manifest Particle-Hole duality
- $\star$  Girvin-MacDonald-Platzman algebra holds up to  $|{f k}|^4$
- $\star$  DC Hall conductivity to  $|{f k}|^2$
- $\star$  Hall viscosity to  $|{\bf k}|^2$
- $\star$  Hints at rich structure of the full  $W_\infty$  theory
- ★ Agrees with Dirac theory for Jain states close to 1/2

#### PROBING THE GEOMETRIC DEGREE OF FREEDOM



Quantitatively, we suddenly switch on a spin-2 perturbation

$$\mathcal{H} \longrightarrow \mathcal{H} + V_{0,2}$$



Liu, AG, Papic (2018)

#### GLOBAL QUENCH



#### GLOBAL QUENCH



#### PROBING THE GEOMETRIC DEGREE OF FREEDOM

Dynamics is obtained via solving the EoM of bimetric theory in tilted magnetic field



#### Can excite higher-spin modes by switching on a spin-4 perturbation

Liu, AG, Papic (2018)

# OPEN PROBLEMS

- ★ Higher spin degrees of freedom and anisotropy
- ★ Bimetric theory of Fractional Chern Insulators
- ★ Multi-layer Fractional Quantum Hall states
- ★ Neutral fermionic collective mode in 5/2 state
- ★ Higher spin formulation of CFL theory
- ★ Geometric theory of Quantum Hall liquid crystals
- ★ Relation to geometric structure of Fracton order



**Bi-layer FQH** 

**FQH** liquid crystal



# WHAT ELSE CAN BIMETRIC THEORY DO?

- $\star$  *Projected* static structure factor up to  $|\mathbf{k}|^6$
- $\star$  Dispersion relation of the GMP mode up to  $|{f k}|^2$
- ★ Absence of the GMP mode and nematic transition in IQH
- ★ Manifest Particle-Hole duality
- $\star$  Girvin-MacDonald-Platzman algebra holds up to  $|{f k}|^4$
- $\star$  DC Hall conductivity to  $|{f k}|^2$
- $\star$  Hall viscosity to  $|{\bf k}|^2$
- $\star$  Hints at rich structure of the full  $W_\infty$  theory

## GEOMETRIC COMPOSITE FERMI LIQUID THEORY

COMPOSITE FERMI LIQUID

States at filling  $\nu = \frac{N}{2N+1} \approx IQH$  of composite fermions at  $\nu_{eff} = N$ 

Can be treated via Fermi liquid theory when N is large

Semi-classically the d.o.f. are multipolar distortions of the Fermi surface



# COMPOSITE FERMI LIQUID IN SMA

Hamiltonian

CCR

$$H = \frac{v_F k_F}{4\pi} \sum_n \int d^2 \mathbf{x} (1 + F_n) u_n(\mathbf{x}) u_{-n}(\mathbf{x}),$$
Phenomenological ``Landau parameters''

$$[u_n(\mathbf{x}), u_m(\mathbf{x}')] = \frac{2\pi}{k_F^2} \Big( n\bar{b}\delta_{n+m,0} - ik_F\delta_{n+m,1}\partial_{\bar{z}} - ik_F\delta_{n+m,-1}\partial_z \Big) \delta(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}')$$

All modes are gapped at  $\Delta_n = n(1+F_n)\omega_c$ 

The limit  $\Delta_2 \ll \Delta_n$  for all  $n \ge 3$  is the SMA

Only dynamics of shear distortions  $u_{\pm 2}$  remains

$$[u_2(\mathbf{x}), u_{-2}(\mathbf{x}')] = \frac{4\pi}{2N+1} \delta(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}') \bullet \mathsf{Same as linearized}$$

Nguyen, AG, Son In Progress

## COMPOSITE FERMI LIQUID IN SMAII

Effective Lagrangian for the quadrupolar (spin-2) mode

$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{SMA}} = -\frac{i}{2} \frac{2N+1}{2\pi} u_2 \dot{u}_{-2} + \frac{i}{2} \frac{N^2 (2N+3)\ell^2}{12\pi} u_2 \Delta \dot{u}_{-2} - \frac{c_0 (2N+1)\omega_c}{2\pi} u_2 u_{-2} + \frac{c_2 (2N+1)\omega_c \ell^2}{2\pi} u_2 \Delta u_{-2}$$

coincides with the linearized bimetric theory

$$\mathcal{L}_{\rm bm} = \frac{2N+1}{16\pi} A d\hat{\omega} - \frac{N^2(2N+3)}{96\pi} \hat{\omega} d\hat{\omega} - \frac{\tilde{m}}{2} \left[ \hat{g}_{ij} g^{ij} - \gamma \right]^2 - \frac{\alpha}{4} \left[ \Gamma - \hat{\Gamma} \right]^2$$

Bimetric theory prescribes coupling of the CFL to curved space <u>Conjecture:</u>

Bimetric theory is the geometric non-linear completion of the CFL <u>in the SMA</u>.

What about beyond SMA ?

GIRVIN - MACDONALD - PLATZMAN MODE

Warning: not standard presentation

The LLL generators of  $W_{\infty}$  are  $\mathcal{L}_{n,m} = \sum_{i=1}^{N_{el}} z_i^{n+1} \partial_{z_i}^{m+1}$  $\downarrow^{\text{LLL Shears, spin-2 operators}}_{\substack{i \in \mathbb{Z}, \mathbb{Z} \\ i \neq 1 \\ i$ 

The projected density operator is expanded in  $\mathcal{L}_{n,m}$ 

$$\bar{\rho}(\mathbf{k}) = e^{-\frac{|k|^2}{2}} \sum_{m,n} c_{nm} \bar{k}^n k^m \mathcal{L}_{n-1,m-1}$$

 $\mathcal{L}_{n,m}$  create *intra*-LL state at momentum **k** 

GIRVIN - MACDONALD - PLATZMAN MODE II

At long wave-lengths the GMP mode is

$$\bar{\rho}(\mathbf{k})|0\rangle = \left[\frac{\mathbf{k}^2}{8}\mathcal{L}_{-1,1} + \frac{\bar{\mathbf{k}}^2}{8}\mathcal{L}_{1,-1} + \dots\right]|0\rangle$$

The GMP state  $\ ar{
ho}({f k})|0
angle$  is a shear distortion at small  $\ {f k}$ 

For IQH 
$$\bar{H} = 0$$
  $\longrightarrow$   $\bar{\rho}(\mathbf{k})|0\rangle$  is a 0 energy state

Consider two-body Hamiltonian  $\bar{H} = \sum_{\mathbf{k}} V(\mathbf{k})\bar{\rho}(-\mathbf{k})\bar{\rho}(\mathbf{k})$ 

Since  $[H, \bar{\rho}(\mathbf{k})] \neq 0$  the shear distortion costs energy

At small  $\,k\,$  GMP mode is a gapped, propagating, shear distortion of the FQH fluid

# ORBITAL SPIN

In the remainder of the talk I will use the term ``orbital spin". In magnetic field electrons quickly move in cyclotron orbits



We consider the limit  $m_{\rm el} \longrightarrow 0$ 

``Orbital spin" describes the coupling of the low energy physics to spatial geometry

# WHAT ELSE CAN BIMETRIC THEORY DO?

Schematic Lagrangian up to three derivatives

$$\mathcal{L}_{\rm bm} = \frac{\nu\varsigma}{2\pi} A d\hat{\omega} - \frac{\hat{c}}{4\pi} \hat{\omega} d\hat{\omega} - \frac{\nu\varsigma}{4\pi} \hat{\nabla}_i E_i B - \frac{\hat{c}\ell^2}{8\pi} \hat{\nabla}_i E_i \hat{R} - \frac{\tilde{m}}{2} \left(\frac{1}{2}\hat{g}_{ij}g^{ij} - \gamma\right)^2 - \frac{\alpha}{4} \left|\Gamma - \hat{\Gamma}\right|^2$$

- $\star$  *Projected* static structure factor up to  $|\mathbf{k}|^6$
- $\star$  Dispersion relation of the GMP mode up to  $|{f k}|^2$
- ★ Absence of the GMP mode and nematic transition in IQH
- ★ Manifest LLL projection and Particle-Hole duality
- $\star$  Girvin-MacDonald-Platzman algebra holds up to  $\,|{f k}|^4$
- $\star$  DC Hall conductivity to  $|{f k}|^2$
- $\star$  Hall viscosity to  $|{\bf k}|^2$
- $\star$  Hints at rich structure of the full  $\,W_\infty\,$  theory